

# 琉球大学学術リポジトリ

## ハーマン・メルヴィルの「エンカンタダス」と文学的表象の問題

メタデータ	言語: 出版者: 琉球大学法文学部 公開日: 2007-12-23 キーワード (Ja): キーワード (En): 作成者: Yamashiro, Shin, 山城, 新 メールアドレス: 所属:
URL	<a href="https://doi.org/10.24564/0002002292">https://doi.org/10.24564/0002002292</a>

## The Landscape in "The Encantadas" and the Problems of Representation

Shin Yamashiro

*I dream of a hard and brutal mysticism in which the naked self  
merges with a non-human world and yet somehow survives still  
intact, individual, separate. Edward Abbey, Desert Solitaire*

This epigraph seems to show that the nineteenth-century writer Herman Melville, and contemporary nature writer Edward Abbey, share some of the trends of representing the natural world in America. Aspiring to face, or merge into, the naked reality of nature, Abbey represents the landscape of the Colorado River and its canyons in *Desert Solitaire*. In doing so, for example, Abbey uses the first Anglo-explorer of Colorado and Grand Canyon, John Wesley Powell's journal through which to seek the initial landscape of the region as well as to co-opt Powell's perspective of nature. Not only does Abbey try to achieve such a vision by actually visiting and facing the initial landscape that Powell and his men encountered in the exploration, but also he attempts to retain "intact, individual, separate." One of the interesting problems here is that Abbey is conscious of a dual self, which Lawrence Buell calls, Abbey's conscious of "self-division" (72); that is, the sense of the "self" that desires to be part of nature, and the "other self" that attempts to be separate from non human world.

Neither is Melville aware of anthropomorphism nor any contemporary arguments on representing the natural environment,

however, I believe that Melville does show some problems of representing the natural world in "The Encantadas" but through a different approach. Just as Abbey does so in representing the landscape of the Colorado, Melville actually visited the Galapagos Islands during 1841-2 for three weeks with the whaleship, the *Acushnet* after he might have read Darwin's account of the place. The landscape of the Encantadas is, thus, a mixture of his expectation and imagination of the unfamiliar landscape, his actual experience of the landscape, and his literary creation of the landscape of the islands, mediated through the other authors' views on the islands. The landscape in "The Encantadas" is actually anchored by its geographical setting; so that we, as contemporary readers, can share with Melville as an actual place. But once looking at the landscape in the story, we have to confront a problem that Abbey shows above: that is, the problem that involves with the representation of landscape, or, for a more general term, the problem of "self-division" in representing the world. "The Encantadas" is a story of landscape as a critical framework to view usefully Melville's perspectives toward the world. For the examination of this issue, I will primarily discuss, with the focus on the composition and effects of his landscape, Melville's strategies of representation of the natural world through examining the structure of his landscape, his point of views, and his aesthetic values embedded in the landscape in "The Encantadas."

To begin with, it is important to look at what constitutes Melville's landscape in "The Encantadas" so that we can obtain a better understanding of how Melville processes his perspectives in creating the landscape. In this respect, Melville's use of the art allusions seems significant to consider. Melville was actually interested in incorporating visual arts and architecture into his prose in general,

because his deliberate use of such artistic elements seems to suggest that Melville at least care about artistic allusions in his writing and their effects in creating landscape. Some scholars have already been devoted to studying this aspects and a most famous scholastic example among them is Robert K. Wallace's *Melville & Turner* (1992) in which Wallace argues that: J.M.W. Turner's powerful aesthetic of the indistinct allowed Ishmael to "articulate Melville's precise sense of the meaning of the whale" (1), and Melville's appropriation of Turner and of the fine arts in general was "not only personally significant but also culturally representative" in the development of American aesthetic in the nineteenth century (5). "The Encantadas" is not an exception in this light. In it, the representation of "Rock Rodondo" in "Sketch Third," for instance, presents Melville's allusions to an architectural design: it is about "two hundred and fifty feet high," and it "occupies, on a larger scale, very much the position which the famous Campanile of detached Bell Tower of St. Mark does with respect to the tangled group of hoary edifices around it" (133-4). According to Douglas Robillard, Melville prepares for such a vision by using, "incomplete consciousness of its appropriateness, the pseudonym, 'Salvator Tarnmoor,' with it's echoes of 'Salvator Rosa' and the blasted landscapes of that Neapolitan artist's best work" (Robillard 160). By alluding to the architectural metaphors mediated through the supposedly artistic narrator's eyes, this is a scene in which we can view Melville's deliberate and artificial landscape. It is also the case in which we can see Melville's use of other writers' account of the Encantadas; for instance, Russell Thomas studies in detail how Melville alters Captain Potter's account of hermit in order to "psychologizes his source materials in conformity with his artistic purpose; namely, the purpose of presenting the Encantadas as places of enchantment, of loneliness, and

of inhospitality" (433).

Not only its use of artistic incorporation of the fine arts and other explorers' accounts of the place, but also its structure itself reminds us that "The Encantadas" is indeed a collection of ten short "sketches" or pictures of the Galapagos Islands, a volcanic archipelago off the coast of Ecuador. It is told by a consistent narrator's view, that of a sailor, Salvador R. Tarnmoor, aboard the whaleship. The narrator tells us what he feels and sees, as well as various other stories the narrator collects relating the landscape he encounters. As many scholars have struggled to find a thematic and structural unity in it, each story is not closely related--except that the first four sketches are devoted mostly to overall landscape of the islands, the next five to stories of human destiny, misery, depravity and isolation in the islands, and the last one deals with "memorializing the islands as hellish sits of wretchedness" (Capper Nichols 132). The book itself appeared in 1854 in three installments in *Putnam's Monthly Magazine*, and in 1856, it was re-collected in his *The Piazza Tales*. So, some readers might assume, "The Encantadas" is a loosely structured book due to its socio-economic situation that Melville and the publisher decided. But its loose structure is also because it includes multiple genres such as journalism, travel writing, poetry, and fiction. The epigraphs to each sketch might be some evidence of Melville's enthusiastic reception of landscape description in *The Faerie Queen* in which one can view some analogies between painting and poetry; it is journalistic and travelogue in the sense that it is partly based on sensationalism and is factual narrative.

Among Melville's use of other genres such as the visual arts and poetry, travel journal and voyagers' logs are most dominant sources to constitute Melville's landscape. Along with Russell Thomas's

bibliographical study of literary sources in "The Encantadas," the editors of the Northwestern-Newsberry Edition put comprehensive notes on Melville's literary borrowings and show how Melville's purpose of "presenting the Enchanted Isles as places of enchantment, of solitariness, and of inhospitality" (Thomas 435). For instance, in "Sketch First," Melville's indebtedness to Charles Darwin's *Voyage of the Beagle* in its descriptions of the Galapagos islands is shown, and in "Sketch Forth," William Cowley's *Voyage Round the Globe*, collected in William Hacke's *A Collection of Original Voyages* (1699) is quoted. In the fifth and sixth sketches, Captain David Porter's *Journal of a Cruise Made to the Pacific Ocean* (1815) and Captain James Conett's *A Voyage to the South Atlantic and Round Cape Horn into the Pacific Ocean* (1798) are respectively used, supposedly, to incorporate some navigational anecdotes as well as dismal atmosphere of the islands. What those scientific travel accounts provide Melville are not just for creating the landscape realistically as a background; but rather, they serve Melville's perspectives through which to look at the islands. Just as the art allusions invites us see the islands as an artistic and structural unity as landscape, those scientific accounts help us see Melville's perspective, and help Melville see the world in the way that he was so accustomed to do.

It is true that the accounts of scientific voyage and exploration were, as Bernard Smith argues, the most powerful means of knowing other people and culture during the eighteenth and late nineteenth century. Especially the published accounts of the exploration to the Pacific and the islands by the French, Russians, British and Americans, "testifies to the culmination of that alliance between art and science which has been one of the main concerns of this investigation" (Smith 333). Analytical and empirical observation was increasingly influential

discourse than, say, the theological view of nature, and it forced the landscape artists during those periods to look at the world through scientific inquiry such as geology. Thus, the landscape of "The Encantadas" shows, first of all, the process of knowing an unfamiliar world by way of scientific and empirical mode, which was an established conventional mode of the day. The opening of "Sketch First," in which we can see tortoises, lizards, immense spiders, snakes, and iguana as well as volcanic descriptions of the islands, for example, presents geological and biological modes of creating the landscape. "In many places the coast is rock-bound, or more properly, clinker-bound," the narrator writes, "tumbled musses of blackish or greenish stuff like the dross of an iron-furnace, forming dark clefts and caves here and there, into which a ceaseless sea pours a fury of foam" (127). Uninhabitableness of the islands is emphasized by such an elaborate description of rocks coupled with the biblical implication of a fallen world. Those scientific details in the landscape is, according to Smith, also a conventional technique in landscape painting in the late nineteenth-century Europe and America. As Smith writes, under the influence of science, "ecological principles began to determine increasingly the forms of unity which the landscape painter imposed upon his material" (Smith 3); and the information retrieved from navigation logs and journals are the materials of the landscape and also a mode of knowing the world.

In addition, these particular, but not exclusive, Melville's voracious references to other genres and materials seem to be compatible with some generic arguments of the novel that M. M. Bakhtin formulates in "Epic and Novel": The novel "parodies other genres (precisely in their role as genres; it exposes the conventionality of their forms and their language; it squeezes out some genres and incorporates other into its

own particular structure, reformulating and re-accentuating them" (5). In a way, this story "parodies" those dominant discourses of science and landscape painting and incorporate into its omnivorous, novelistic discourse primarily because this account of the islands is not so much using one exclusive discourse but is skeptic about the generic distinctions. "The Encantadas" is of course fictional due to Melville's imaginative creation of some of the geographical facts on the Galapagos Islands and his use of anecdotes associated with the island. However, what makes this story fictional is derived also from Melville's novelistic technique of reformulating and re-accentuating other materials, too. Melville does not completely blend multiple genres together, which is his tendency in other writings, as such *Moby-Dick*. In it, he includes drama, dialogue, science, and anthropology as well as travelogue and fiction in sometimes most visible ways. Therefore, what is at stakes is the process, perspective, or vision that is inherently accentuated by the landscape of the Encantadas.

In incorporating yet retaining other materials, it is also interesting to note that Melville sometimes leaves the allusions and appropriation obvious as if to wish the readers could notice them. One of the most interesting examples of this technique is Melville's using statistics on page 140 where the narrator lists the population of Albemarle. To list estimates of native habitat, its population is a conventional political discourse of the colonial age and to see such numbers shows Melville's another attempt to incorporate other genre. And, by doing so, it seems what Melville is critical about is at least representing a multiple perspective or mode of looking at the world. In fact, as the term "sketches" suggests, "The Encantadas" can be "viewed" critically in the sense it deals with the issues of representation and perspective. In a way, readers are looking at different landscapes through the frames of

each sketch, by which the landscape of the Galapagos Islands is conceived or arranged by the narrator's point of view, which is at the same time, layered through Melville's artistic creation. In order to clarify Melville artistic creation, I will consider the narrator's point of view thematically as to what cultural expressions can be found in it and as to what "Melville aesthetic" is like.

With regard to the tortoise descriptions in "Sketch Second," the narrator goes on to imply that we can find not entirely dark, sullen, lonely, and melancholy landscape, but also some bright elements. For Melville, it is also important to behold both aspects dynamically; like his frequent tendency toward ambiguity and indeterminacy, he is always careful about a multiple point of view. And these ideas are most eminent in recurrent images of the tortoise. These famous lines show the narrator's story of putting tortoises on their backs:

Neither should he who cannot turn the tortoise from its natural position so as to hide the darker and expose his livelier aspect, like a great October pumpkin in the sun, for that cause declare the creature to be one total inky blot. The tortoise is both black and bright. But let us to particulars. (130)

Both black and bright are natural; thus, in the Encantadas, bright should be found; It might be misleading statement because Melville does not necessarily suggest us to look at bright side; it is both dark and bright. Although the narrator's overall tone is dark and pessimistic, Melville leaves a possibility of bright side, however little it might be in the story. What the narrator suggests us, therefore, is to embrace such a dual aspect; nonetheless, what the narrator does is almost to negate the optimistic view. It is obvious that the story itself is overshadowed with ambiguous and indeterminable point of views toward its island. Look at "Sketch Fifth," for another example, in

which the mysteriously changeable currents and winds of the islands are depicted. Melville's ambiguous point of view toward dark and bright is also crucial to look at his landscape at large. For him, as John Bryant argues, "art must occupy a middle ground between dream and form, and too much control or too much fancy can deaden the final effect" (161). I will paraphrase Bryan's view that Melville is also conscious about representing picturesque landscape in which it often seeks a "tension between the disorderly or irrelevant and the perfect form" (Martin 277). Although Bryant does not acknowledge this, it is the trope of American picturesque that accommodates the tragic or awesome sublime as well as serene beautiful; it also generally recommends "the rough or rugged, the crumbling form, the complex or difficult harmony" (qtd. in Conron 7). It is worth noting again Melville is conscious about his art of pictorial composition, combination of arts into landscape; he arranges forms deliberately and structures the unity of effect consciously.

Now let us look at more specific aspects of his landscape. One of the dominant tones of the island is dark terror. In many places, the coast is "clinker-bound" and there are dark caves into which a "ceaseless sea pours a fury of foam," as well as a "swirl of birds heightening the dismal din" (127). On the beaches, there are multitudinous dead shells, with decayed bits of sugar-cane, bamboos, and coconuts, in which we can view an expression of physical power embedded in the objects on the beach. The narrator goes on to depict the landscape as follows: "while mixed with the relics of distant beauty you will sometimes see fragments of charred wood and mouldering ribs of wrecks" (127).

This landscape may remind readers of some of the picturesque paintings of Thomas Cole or Turner in which both beauty and sublimity are presented by such combination of elements as dead trees,

the frightened deer, or the massed height of the mountains, the clouds, and so forth. In Cole's typical picturesque painting, there are dead trees whose limbs were dropped; and those dead trees are contrasted with lively foliage. The contrast between the dead and alive is also represented by the colors of dead trees, bright blue mountains, and the sun light. In other words, picturesque painting presents, on the one hand, a formalistic tension between the dead/alive or incomplete/complete. But it also embodies thematic and metaphoric contrasts that are suggested by colors and moods. In those picturesque paintings, there are some conventional structures in which one can find synthesized effect based on a contrast between the sublimity of the dead trees and the lively mountains, lakes, or forests. Just as Melville uses novelistic technique of incorporating other genres structurally, he uses those grammatical frameworks of the picturesque landscape to present seascape, but by using terrestrial aesthetics. Though Melville is said to disagree with the American picturesque tradition as optimistic, the way he creates the landscape is, in fact, in the tradition of American picturesque.

No matter how desolate and hopeless this landscape may sound, it is different from what is a most stereotypical southern tropical islands might be. As the narrator tells us, the landscape of the Encantadas is such an unexpectedly grotesque one that the narrator feels "this apparent fleetingness and unreality of the locality of the isles was most probably one reason for the Spaniards called them the Encantada or Enchanted Group" (128). Or as its other Spanish name "Gallipagos" suggests, the narrator tells a superstition that "all wicked sea-officers, more especially commodores and captains, are at death ... transformed into tortoises" (128). Whatever the etymology of the name of the island may be speculated by the narrator, what is interesting for our

study of landscape is that those names and seamen's imagination are associated but are separated at the same time. In other words, what people expect to see there is quite different from what people actually see; accordingly, the image that the name of the island "The Encantadas" might evoke and the reality of landscape are so separate that what this story shows is the narrator's struggle to come to terms with its reality.

Here again, what Edward Abbey describes in the epigraph is exactly this separation of "naked self" and "non-human world" as well as his yearning for the merging of both in representing the world. There is a gap between the narrator's impression on the landscape, and the landscape created through Melville's picturesque technique via the artistic narrator's eye. What Melville is concerned about is, then, not simply to merge into the landscape of the Encantadas. But rather, a complicated composition of the landscape of the islands and the process of how to come to terms with it. Or, it seems that W.J.T. Mitchell echoes Abbey when he writes: "Landscape painting is best understood, then, not as the uniquely central medium that gives us access to ways of seeing landscape, but as a representation of something that is already a representation in its own right" (14). That is, the landscape is already "artifice" upon perceiving, "long before it becomes the subject of pictorial representation" (Mitchell 14). "The Encantadas" is in this sense a book of the landscape of the Galapagos Islands through which to make us confront some problems of representing other, or world exists apart from human beings.

Of course, again, Melville does not claim nor formulate his idea of landscape as a way to answer those problems. Rather, Melville problematizes those issues of representation by using the framework of landscape critically. As John Bryan sees, Melville's picturesque is not

entirely systematic and conventional, that is why Melville's landscape is so differently picturesque from, for example, Washington Irving, James Fenimore Cooper, or Henry David Thoreau. But considering his voracious interest in various kinds of arts in composing his writing, and his frequent critique against the conventional romanticism, Within the tradition of American picturesque, Melville's landscape encompasses seemingly contradictory elements of landscape he creates. In this sense, I agree with Samuel Otter--though his discussion is exclusively on race in Melville's writings in "'Race'--in *Typee* and *White-Jacket*" in which he states that "Melville is critical but does not claim, or rather comes to realize that he cannot sustain, the privilege of an outsider's position" (12). Unlike Otter, my discussion exclusively on Melville's landscape, technique, and perspective; I believe Melville's also includes the issues of race, colonialism, and in more general, representation of the world. And, like Otter, I do not mean to claim that Melville loudly criticizes or contemplates racism in "The Encantadas," but rather, my point is to suggest that he shows some critical point of view toward representing the environment of the Encantadas, which leads to a problem of representing also, culture and nature.

As I studied "The Encantadas," we can view landscape of the islands as Melville's perspective or a critical framework because it deals with the issues of composition, perspective and the unity of both. Melville consciously incorporates multiple genres to create his own landscape of the islands. The composition of Melville's materials suggests us his perspective of the world, and the American tradition of picturesque seems the most important for Melville to unite all of those materials. As John Conron formulates in *The American Landscape*: "The picturesque was a visual than an emotional impressionism, and one of its most important literary functions was to temper the sensationalism

which the sublime had given rise to. It focused more on the composition of the scene than on the viewer's sensibility" (165). Melville's use of "sketches" is crucial because sketches are most basic components of the overall landscape. Though the sketches of "The Encantadas" are more complete and adorned than a typical "rough" sketch; but they are, as the organic form of the picturesque, "cool enough, plastic enough, to harbor the spirit of play in both of its meanings" (Conron 165). Because it is a collection of sketches, we can view better the anatomy of Melville's landscape. "The spirit of play" indeed explains what Melville shows in "The Encantadas," too; Melville is playful to use other genre and discourse to create the landscape of his own. In addition to this, the most often quoted anecdote on the dark and light sides of tortoises comes to mind; however, the most playful aspect of all seems to be the idea of representing the landscape, representing the world outside us. Unlike Abbey's dream of a "hard and brutal mysticism in which the naked self merges with a non-human world and yet somehow survives still intact, individual, separate," Melville is not so desperate in finding a way of achieving the self, which is separate from the outside world; but rather, Melville is more conscious of composing the landscape and of creating the effect of the landscape. That is, for Melville, there should be a separation of the viewer, the outside world, and the landscape that mediate both; and there is no concern about what Abbey is grappling.

## Works Cited

- Abbey, Edward. *Desert Solitaire: A Season in The Wilderness*. New York: Ballantine, 1968.
- Bakhtin, M.M. "Epic and Novel." *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Ed. Michael Holquist. Trans. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: U of Texas P, 1981. 3-39.
- Bryant, John. "Toning Down the Green: Melville's Picturesque." *Savage Eye: Melville and the Visual Arts*. Ed. Christopher Sten. Kent, Ohio: Kent State UP, 1991. 145-61.
- Buell, Lawrence. *The Environmental Imagination: Thoreau, Nature Writing, and the Formation of American Culture*. Harvard: Harvard UP, 1995.
- Conron, John. *American Picturesque*. University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State UP, 2000.
- Hagstrum, Jean H. *The Sister Arts: The Tradition of Literary Pictorialism and English Poetry from Dryden to Gray*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1958.
- Melville, Herman. "The Encantadas." *The Piazza Tales and Other Prose Pieces: 1839-1860*. Ed. Harrison Hayford, Alma A. MacDouall, G. Thomas Tanselle, et al. Evanston: Northwestern UP, 1987. 125-73.
- Mitchell, W.J.T. "Imperial Landscape." *Landscape and Power*. Ed. W.J.T. Mitchell. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1994. 5-34.
- Otter, Samuel. "'Race' in *Typee* and *White-Jacket*." *The Cambridge Companion to Herman Melville*. Ed. Robert S. Levine. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1998. 12-36.
- Price, Martin. "The Picturesque Moment." *From Sensibility to Romanticism*. Ed. Frederick Hilles and Harold Bloom. New

- York: Oxford UP, 1965.
- Robillard, Douglas. *Melville and The Visual Arts: Ionian Form, Venetian Tint*. Kent, Ohio: Kent State UP, 1997.
- Smith, Bernard. *European Vision and the South Pacific*. 2nd ed. New Haven: Yale UP, 1985.
- Stein, Roger B. *Seascape and the American Imagination*. New York: Whitney Museum of American Art, 1975.
- Thomas, Russell. "Melville's Use of Some Sources in 'The Encantadas.'" *American Literature* 3 (1932): 432-56.
- Wallace, Robert K. *Melville & Turner: Spheres of Love and Fright*. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1992.

# ハーマン・メルヴィルの「エンカンタダス」と 文学的表象の問題

## 論文要旨

文学研究における「表象」の問題はこれまで様々な形で問われてきた。「誰が」「誰を」「何を」そして「どのように」描くのか、またそれは「なぜ」なのか。フェミニズム、ジェンダー、コロニアリズム等、20世紀を代表する諸学派が文学研究で常に問題意識として持っていたのも「表象」をめぐる問題であると言えるし、比較的新しい環境文学研究で見えてくるのも「自然」という「他者」をめぐる表象の問題であり、そこから照射される「自己」の問題である。

本論文ではハーマン・メルヴィルの短編小説「エンカンタダス」に焦点を絞る。「エンカンタダス」はメルヴィルの他作品に比べるとあまり注目されないが、メルヴィルの作品の全体像を見ると、彼がどのように他者を描くのかというプロセスを見るために重要な作品である。メルヴィルの作品に頻出するテーマをいくつか具体的に見ていきながら、メルヴィルがどのように他者を描くのかというプロセスを示してみたい。その際にメルヴィルがジョセフ・ターナーの絵画に影響を受けたこと、その影響が必ずしも風景論やピクチャレスク等の概念的・思想的なものに留まらず、小説技法的にも目に見える形で現れていること、絵画のみならず他の芸術的ジャンルを意図的と思えるようなやり方で混ぜ合わせていること、等を指摘していく。そしてそれらを根拠にメルヴィルが持っていた問題意識の一つが「他者」<sup>1</sup>をめぐる表象の問題であったと主張する。

---

<sup>1</sup> この論文中で用いられる「他者」(others)とは自分以外の全ての存在(例えば、動物や自然)を幅広く含んでいる。